

Philosophy of Religions, The Divinity School
Guidelines for the qualifying examination in Philosophies of India
(Philosophy of Religion IVa-c)

Professors Matthew Kapstein and Dan Arnold

General information

1. The examination in Philosophies of India is intended for graduate students in the Divinity School who are specializing in the study of Indian philosophy, or who are pursuing it as an elective area in which it is desirable to demonstrate competence. In either case, the requirement *sine qua non* for taking the examination is the successful completion of both quarters of the two-quarter course sequence, “Introduction to the Philosophies of India” (DVPR 605 30201 and DVPR 605 30302), which is offered in alternating years. Students specializing in Indian philosophy or in South Asian religions will generally be expected in addition to be at an advanced level of study in the relevant primary languages (chiefly Sanskrit). Students for whom it is an elective examination may, where appropriate, work in the area solely on the basis of translations and secondary studies.
2. Because Indian philosophy is an exceptionally wide area of study, it is not possible to specify a unique textual “canon” that is suitable for all students. The examination may be taken in one of three forms, each of which addresses the area from a different perspective. In all cases, however, the examination is designed to demonstrate breadth of competence in the area, as well as the student’s deepening grasp of particular themes of interest. The examinations in “Early Indian Philosophy” and “Indian Scholastic Philosophy” correspond broadly to the two quarters of the introductory course, while that in “Indian Buddhist Philosophy” focuses specifically on the works of Buddhist thinkers.
3. The following three representative bibliographies offer standard models for the exam. The degree to which one emphasizes direct study of the primary texts in any given area may be varied according to one’s linguistic level and the opportunities one has had for study of particular textual traditions. For the exam in “Indian Buddhist Philosophy,” recommended Sanskrit text editions are specified, as well as some representative reference works. Similar information will be added for the first two exams in a later version.

Examination A. Early Indian Philosophy

I. On the history and direction of the study of Indian philosophy:

Daya Krishna, "Three Myths about Indian Philosophy," *Diogenes* (July-September, 1966); reprinted in Daya Krishna, *Indian Philosophy: A Counter Perspective*, pp.3-15. Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1991.

Daniel H. H. Ingalls, "The Comparison of Indian and Western Philosophy," *Journal of Oriental Research*, Madras, vol. 22 (1954): 1-11.

Frits Staal, "Euclid and Pāṇini," *Philosophy East and West* 15 (1965): 99-116; reprinted in F. Staal, *Universals* (University of Chicago Press).

Frits Staal, "The Science of Language," in Gavin Flood, ed., *The Blackwell Companion to Hinduism*, pp.348-359.

Jonardon Ganeri, "Indian Logic and the Colonization of Reason," in Jonardon Ganeri, ed., *Indian Logic: A Reader*, pp.1-25. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 2001.

Karl Potter, *Presuppositions of India's Philosophies*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1991.

J. N. Mohanty, *Classical Indian Philosophy*. ppr. Rowman and Littlefield 2000.

II. The pre-philosophical background:

Michael Witzel, "Vedas and Upaniṣads," in Gavin Flood, ed., *The Blackwell Companion to Hinduism*, pp. 68-98. Oxford: Blackwell, 2003.

Steven Collins, *Selfless Persons: Imagery and Thought in Theravāda Buddhism*, pp.41-63, 271-274 (endnotes). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.

Patrick Olivelle, trans., *Upaniṣads*, pp. xxix-xxxvi, xlix-lvi, 34-71, 146-156, 171-176, 231-247. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.

F. Edgerton, "Introduction" to *The Beginnings of Indian Philosophy*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1965.

R. A. Zaehner, trans., *The Bhagavad Gītā: With a Commentary Based on the Original Sources*. Oxford University Press, 1969.

III. Early Buddhism and Jainism:

Steven Collins, *Selfless Persons: Imagery and Thought in Theravāda Buddhism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.

Rupert Gettin, *The Foundations of Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Padmanabh Jaini, *The Jaina Path of Purification*, chs. 3-5. California 1979.

Umasvāti, *That Which Is: The Tattvārtha Sūtra*. Trans. Nathmal Tatia. San Francisco: Harper Collins, 1994.

IV. The early philosophical systems or "perspectives" (*darśana*)

Wilhelm Halbfass, "Darśana, Ānvīkṣikī, Philosophy," in Wilhelm Halbfass, *India and Europe: An Essay in Understanding*, pp. 263-287. Albany: SUNY Press, 1988.

Wilhelm Halbfass, “The Presence of the Veda in Indian Philosophical Reflection,” in Wilhelm Halbfass, *Tradition and Reflection: Explorations in Indian Thought*, pp.23-49. Albany: SUNY Press, 1991.

A. Pūrva Mīmāṃsā

Francis X. Clooney, *Thinking Ritually: Rediscovering the Pūrva Mīmāṃsā of Jaimini*. Vienna: Institut für Indologie der Universität Wien, 1990. (Volume XVII of Gerhard Oberhammer, ed., Publications of the De Nobili Research Library.)

Sheldon Pollock, “Mīmāṃsā and the Problem of History in Traditional India,” *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 109/4 (1989): 603-610.

Ganganath Jha, trans. *Śābara-bhāṣya*, pp.8-38 (treating Jaimini’s Mīmāṃsā Sūtras, I.5-18). Baroda: Gaekwad's Oriental Series (vols. 66, 70, 73), 1973-74. Second edition.

Sanskrit text of the latter: K. V. Abhyankar, ed., *Mīmāṃsādarśanam*, vol. I: *Śrīmājaiminipraṇīte Mīmāṃsādarśane Prathamādhyāyasya Tarkapādanāma Prathamapādaḥ*. Trivandrum: Ānandāśrama Sanskrit Series, vol. 97, 1930-1934. [Reprinted 1976.]

B. Sāṃkhya and Yoga

Barbara Stoler Miller, trans., *Yoga: Discipline of Freedom: The Yoga Sūtras attributed to Patañjali*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996.

Erich Frauwallner, *History of Indian Philosophy*, vol. 1, pp. 217-315. Trans. V. M. Bedekar. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1973.

Gerald Larson, *Classical Sāṃkhya: An Interpretation of its History and Meaning*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1979.

Eli Franco, “Whatever Happened to the Yuktidīpikā?” *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens und Archiv für indische Philosophie*, Band 35 (1991): 123-137.

Christopher Chapple, “The Unseen Seer and the Field: Consciousness in Sāṃkhya and Yoga,” in Robert K. C. Forman, ed., *The Problem of Pure Consciousness: Mysticism and Philosophy*, pp.53-70. New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.

C. Uttara Mīmāṃsā (= “Vedānta”)

Richard King, *Early Advaita Vedānta and Buddhism: The Mahāyāna Context of the Gaudpādīya-kārikā*. Albany: SUNY Press, 1995.

Śaṅkara’s *Upadeśasāhasrī*: Sengaku Mayeda, trans., ed., *A Thousand Teachings: The Upadeśasāhasrī of Śaṅkara*. Albany: SUNY Press, 1992.

Sanskrit text of the latter: Sengaku Mayeda, ed., *Śaṅkara’s Upadeśasāhasrī, Critically Edited with Introduction and Indices*. Tokyo: Hokuseido Press, 1973.

Francis Clooney, "Advaita as Uttara Mīmāṃsā: The Pūrva Mīmāṃsā Paradigm," in Francis Clooney, *Theology after Vedānta: An Experiment in Comparative Theology*, pp.23-30. Albany: SUNY Press, 1993.

Francis Clooney, "Scholasticisms in Encounter: Working through a Hindu Example," in José Cabezón, ed., *Scholasticism: Cross-Cultural and Comparative Perspectives*, pp.177-199. Albany: SUNY Press, 1998.

Examination B. Indian Scholastic Philosophies

The examination in Indian Scholastic Philosophies aims to establish the student's familiarity with selected key areas in the study of the philosophical traditions that developed under the influence of the great advances in Indian logic, epistemology and grammar that first came to fruition in about the mid-first millenium, and thenceforth determined the forms of argument in Indian philosophy. Students electing to take exam B should begin by choosing four or at most five of the subject areas listed below as the basis for the bibliography.

The Philosophy of Language

Harold Coward and K. Kunjunni Raja, *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies*, Vol. 5: *The Philosophy of the Grammarians*, pp. 3-97 ("Introduction to the Philosophy of the Grammarians"). Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990.

Matilal, Bimal Krishna. *The Word and the World*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1990.

Kunjunni Raja, *Indian Theories of Meaning*. 2nd ed. Madras: Adyar Library and Research Center, 1977.

K. P. Subramania Iyer, *Bhartrhari: A Study of the Vākyapadīya in the Light of the Ancient Commentaries*. Poona: Deccan College Postgraduate and Research Institute, 1969.

D'Sa, Francis X. 1980. *Śabdaprāmāṇyam in Śabara and Kumārila: Towards a Study of the Mīmāṃsā Experience of Language*. Vienna: Publications of the De-Nobili Research Library (vol. VII), 1980.

Ganeri, Jonardon, *Semantic Powers: Meaning and the Means of Knowing in Classical Indian Philosophy*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Logic and Epistemology:

(Note: Because this is an exceptionally large area, one may choose some particular topic such as perception or logic as a point of focus and make a selection of texts accordingly. Alternatively, one's selection may be designed to represent the general contours of the area. The favored approach will depend upon the shape of the exam list overall.)

Matilal, Bimal Krishna. 1977. *Nyāya-vaiśeṣika*, in Jan Gonda, ed., *A History of Indian Literature*, vol. 6, fasc. 2. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

Jhā, Gangānātha. 1984. *The Nyāya Sūtras of Gautama*. 2 vols. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass. Ganganath Jha, trans., *Ślokavārtika: Translated from the Original Sanskrit with Extracts from the Commentaries "Kāśikā" of Sucarita Miśra and "Nyāyaratnākara" of Pārtha Sārathi Miśra*. Calcutta: Asiatic Society of Bengal, 1900. (Reprint: Delhi: Sri Satguru, 1983.)

- Sanskrit text of the latter: Swami Dwarikadas Shastri, ed., *Ślokavārttika of Śrī Kumārila Bhaṭṭa, with the Commentary Nyāyaratnākara of Śrī Pārthasārathi Miśra*. Varanasi: Tara Publications, 1978.
- Dunne, John. *The Foundations of Dharmakīrti's Philosophy*. Wisdom 2005.
- Matilal, Bimal Krishna. 1986. *Perception*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Hattori, Masaaki. 1968. *Dignāga, On Perception*. Harvard Oriental Series, vol. 47. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Series.
- Taber, John. *A Hindu Critique of Buddhist Epistemology*. Routledge 2005.
- Matilal, Bimal Krishna. 1981. *The Central Philosophy of Jainism*. L.D. Institute of Indology.
- Ganeri, Jonardon. 2001. *Philosophy in Classical India*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Mohanty, J. N. 1989. *Gaṅgeśa's Theory of Truth*. Motilal Banarsidass.

Metaphysics and Ontology

- Halbfass, Wilhelm. 1992. *On Being and What There Is: Classical Vaiśeṣika and the History of Indian Ontology*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Jha, Ganganatha, *Padārthadharmasaṅgraha of Praśastapāda : with the Nyāyakandalī of Śrīdhara*. Varanasi, Chaukhambha, 1982.
- Tachikawa, Musashi, *The structure of the world in Udayana's realism : a study of the Lakṣaṇāvalī and the Kiraṇāvalī*, Reidel 1981.
- Chemparathy, George. 1972. *An Indian Rational Theology*. Vienna: De Nobili Research Library.
- Billmoria, P. "Hindu Doubts about God," *International Philosophical Quarterly* 30 (1990): 481-99.
- Chakrabarti, Kisor, "The Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika Theory of Universals," *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 3 (1975): 363-82.

Skeptical Tendencies in Indian Thought: The Philosophies of Nāgārjuna, Jayarāśi, and Śrīharṣa

- Bhattacharya, Kamaleswar, *The dialectical method of Nāgārjuna = Vigrahavyāvartanī*, Motilal Banarsidass 1986.
- Franco, Eli. 1987. *Perception, Knowledge, and Disbelief: A Study of Jayarāśi's Scepticism*. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Garfield, Jay. L. 1995. *The Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Garfield, Jay. L. 1990. "Epoché and Sunyatā: Scepticism East and West." *Philosophy East and West* 40/3: 285-308.
- Granoff, Phyllis. 1978. *Philosophy and Argument in Late Vedānta*. Reidel.
- Siderits, Mark, "Nāgārjuna as Anti-Realist," *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 16 (1988): 311-25.
- Matilal, B. K. "The Logical Illumination of Indian Mysticism," in J. Ganeri, ed., *The Collected Essays of Bimal Krishna Matilal: Mind, Language and World* (New Delhi: Oxford), pp. 38-64.

The Vedānta Traditions

- Deutsch, E., and J. A. B. van Buitenen, eds., *A Sourcebook of Advaita Vedānta*. Hawaii 1971.
- Wilhelm Halbfass, ed., *Philology and Confrontation: Paul Hacker on Traditional and Modern Vedānta*. Albany: SUNY Press, 1995.
- Carman, John. *The Theology of Rāmānuja*. Yale 1974.
- Sarma, Deepak, *Epistemologies and the Limitations of Philosophical Inquiry: Doctrine in Madhva Vedānta*. Routledge 2005.

Ram-Prasad, C., *Advaita Epistemology and Metaphysics*. RoutledgeCurzon 2002.

Aesthetics and Poetics

Chari, V. K., *Sanskrit Criticism*. Hawai'i 1990.

Gnoli, Raniero, *The Aesthetic Experience according to Abhinavagupta*. Rome 1956 (or Indian reprint).

Ingalls, Masson and Patwardhan, *The Dhvanyāloka of Ānandavardhana with the Locana of Abhinavagupta*. Harvard 1990.

Masson and Patwardhan, *Śāntarasa and Abhinavagupta's philosophy of aesthetics*, Poona, Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, 1969.

Zimmer, Heinrich. 1984. *Artistic Form and Yoga in the Sacred Images of India*, translated by Gerald Chapple and James B. Lawson. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Gerow, Edwin, "Abhinavagupta's Aesthetics," *Journal of the Americal Oriental Society* 114 (1994): 186-208.

Examination C: Indian Buddhist Philosophy

This exam is designed to give students a grounding in the primary sources of the Indian Buddhist philosophical tradition in its mature, “scholastic” phase (roughly, the latter two thirds of the first millennium), and to represent the most significant trajectories of thought that developed in that period. Students specializing in this area should read the primary source texts below with significant consultation of the works in their original language (which for these texts is Sanskrit) – or, where Sanskrit originals are not known to survive, in the version closest to that (usually, the Tibetan translations). (Students not specializing in the area may work with translations alone.) Careful study of these texts should serve to orient students to the broader range of philosophical discourse in Buddhist India. The goal is to become acquainted with the contents and the discursive and logical styles of these texts, so that the student will be in a good position to situate and approach almost any other Indian Buddhist philosophical work.

Vasubandhu (fl. c. 360 CE), **Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam.**

Editions: **1.** Prahlad Pradhan, ed., *Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam* of Vasubandhu (Patna: K. P. Jayaswal Research Institute, 1975). This includes only Vasubandhu’s root text and commentary, and is the edition that is indexed by Hirakawa. **2.** Swami Dwarikadas Shastri, ed., *Ācāryayaśomitrakṛtasphuṭārthavyākhopetam Ācāryavasubandhuviracitam svopajñabhāṣyasahitañ ca Abhidharmakośam* (Varanasi: Bauddha Bharati, 1998 [Bauddha Bharati Series, vols. 5-8, printed in two books with continuous pagination].) This includes, in addition to Vasubandhu’s texts, the subcommentary of Yaśomitra (fl. c. 580), the *Abhidharmakośasphuṭārthavyākhyā*.

Translations: There is no complete translation into English from the Sanskrit. Leo Pruden’s translation (Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 1988-90) is actually a translation of the French translation by Louis de La Vallée Poussin (1923-1931), which in turn was done from the Tibetan and Chinese translations of Vasubandhu’s text (with the Sanskrit text not known to have been extant at the time of La Vallée Poussin’s study). Pruden’s translation is therefore to be used with caution. A reliable translation of chapter 1 was done by Bruce Cameron Hall: “Vasubandhu on ‘Aggregates, Spheres, and Components’: Being Chapter One of the *Abhidharmakośa*.” (Harvard Ph.D. dissertation, 1983). A reliable translation of chapter 9 is available in Matthew Kapstein, *Reason’s Traces: Identity and Interpretation in Indian & Tibetan Buddhist Thought*, pp.347-375. (Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2001.)

Background studies and reference works: Collett Cox, *Disputed Dharmas: Early Buddhist Theories on Existence: An Annotated Translation of the Section on Factors Dissociated from Thought from Saṃghabhadra’s Nyāyānusāra* (Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 1995); Paul Williams, “On the *Abhidharma* Ontology,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 9 (1981): 227-257; Sukomal Chaudhuri, *Analytical Study of the Abhidharmakośa* (Calcutta Sanskrit College Research Series No. CXIV, 1976); Akira Hirakawa, et al, *Index to the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* (P. Pradhan Edition) (Tokyo: Daizo Shuppan Kabushikikaisha, 1973).

Vasubandhu, **Karmasiddhiprakaraṇa**.

Edition: The Sanskrit text of this is not extant. The Tibetan translation (Toh. 4062) was edited by Etienne Lamotte, who also translated it into French; his edition and translation are available in “Le Traite de l’Acte de Vasubandhu (Karma-siddhi-prakaraṇa),” *Mélanges chinoise et bouddhiques*, vol. 4 (1936): 151-263.

Translation: Lamotte’s French translation was rendered into English by Leo Pruden, under the title *Karmasiddhiprakaraṇa: The Treatise on Action by Vasubandhu* (Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 1987). As with Pruden’s “translation” of the *Abhidharmakośa*, this should be used with caution. This text is also translated in Stefan Anacker, *Seven Works of Vasubandhu: The Buddhist Psychological Doctor* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984), pp.83-156.

Vasubandhu, **Vimśatikā**, **Triṃśikā**.

Edition: Lévi, Sylvain, ed., *Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi: Deux Traités de Vasubandhu: Vimśatikā (La Vingtaine), Accompagnée d’une Explication en Prose, et Triṃśikā (La Trentaine)*, avec le Commentaire de Sthiramati. (Paris: Librairie Ancienne Honoré Champion, 1925).

Translations: Particularly the *Vimśatikā* has been translated numerous times, though some of the widely used translations (several of which are from the influential Chinese translations of Vasubandhu) are not very reliable. Translations include those available in Stefan Anacker, *Seven Works of Vasubandhu: The Buddhist Psychological Doctor* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984), and Thomas P. Kochumuttom, *A Buddhist Doctrine of Experience: A New Translation and Interpretation of the Works of Vasubandhu the Yogācārin* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982).

Studies and reference works: Of the vast bibliography on these texts, the following representative works might be singled out: André Bareau, “Index of *Vimśatikā* and *Triṃśikā* of Vasubandhu,” *Vak* 3 (1953): 102-128; Matthew Kapstein, “Mereological Considerations in Vasubandhu’s Proof of Idealism,” in *Kapstein’s Reason’s Traces*, pp.181-204; Bruce Cameron Hall, “The Meaning of *Vijñapti* in Vasubandhu’s Concept of Mind,” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 9/1 (1986): 7-23; Richard King, “*Vijñaptimātratā* and the *Abhidharma* Context of Early *Yogācāra*,” *Asian Philosophy* 8/1 (1998): 5-17.

Asaṅga (fl. c. 360), **Abhidharmasamuccaya**.

Editions: The original Sanskrit text of this is only partially extant; see V. V. Gokhale, ed., “Fragments from the *Abhidharmasamuccaya* of Asaṅga,” *Journal of the Bombay Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society, New Series*, 23 (1947): 13-38. Prahlad Pradhan prepared an edition/reconstruction of the complete Sanskrit text from the available fragments and from the Tibetan translation (Toh. 4049): *Abhidharmasamuccaya* of Asaṅga (Santiniketan: Visvabharati, 1950).

Translation: Walpola Rahula published a French translation from Pradhan's edition/reconstruction: *Le Compendium de la Super-Doctrine (Philosophie) (Abhidharmasamuccaya) d'Asaṅga* (Deuxième Édition; Paris: École Française d'Extrême-Orient, 1980). Now translated into English by Sara Boin-Webb: *Abhidharmasamuccaya* (Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 2001).

Studies: Robert Kritzer, *Rebirth and Causation in Yogācāra Abhidharma* (Wien: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien, Universität Wien, 1999).

Asaṅga, **Mahāvānasamgraha**.

Edition: The original Sanskrit text is lost. The Tibetan translation (Toh. 4048) was edited by Etienne Lamotte, *La Somme du Grand Véhicule d'Asaṅga (Mahāvānasamgraha)*, Tome I: Versions Tibétaine et Chinoise (Hiuan-Tsang) (Louvain-la-Neuve: Université de Louvain, Institut Orientaliste, 1973).

Translation: Tome 2 of Lamotte's work comprises a French translation of the text, together with significant extracts from the commentaries of Vasubandhu (the *Mahāvānasamgrahabhāṣya*) and *Asvabhāva (the *Mahāvānasamgraha-upanibandhana*). Chapter 10 is translated into English (along with all available commentaries) in Paul Griffiths, et al, *The Realm of Awakening: A Translation and Study of the Tenth Chapter of Asaṅga's Mahāvānasamgraha* (Oxford University Press, 1989).

Maitreya / Asaṅga / Vasubandhu, **Madhyāntavibhāga**.

Edition: Ram Chandra Pandeya. *Madhyāntavibhāgaśāstram, Ācāryamaitreyakṛtakārikābhiḥ, Ācāryavasubandhukṛtena bhāṣyena, Sthiramatikṛtaṭīkāyā ca samvalitam* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1999). This includes the root text (the "Madhyāntavibhāga," proper), which is traditionally attributed to Maitreya, and represented as having been "recovered" by Asaṅga; the bhāṣya of Vasubandhu; and the subcommentary (ṭīkā) of Sthiramati (fl. c. 560). The text and Vasubandhu's commentary alone were also edited by Gadjin Nagao: *Madhyāntavibhāga-bhāṣya: A Buddhist Philosophical Treatise* (Tokyo: Suzuki Research Foundation, 1964), which includes detailed indices of Sanskrit, Tibetan, and Chinese terms.

Translation: The root text and the commentary of Vasubandhu are translated in Anacker, *Seven Works of Vasubandhu*, pp.191-286 (which should be used with caution). There is a dated translation by Th. Stcherbatsky: *Madhyāntavibhāga: Discourse on Discrimination between Middle and Extremes*, ascribed to Maitreya and commented by Vasubandhu and Sthiramati (St. Petersburg: Neudruck der Ausgabe, 1936; Bibliotheca Buddhica 30).

Dharmakīrti (fl. c. 640), **Nvāyabindu**.

Edition: Paṇḍita Dalsukhbhai Malvania, ed., Paṇḍita Durveka Miśra's *Dharmottarapradīpa* (Patna: Kashiprasad Jayaswal Research Institute, 1971). This edition comprises the brief kārikās of Dharmakīrti; the innovative commentary of

Dharmottara (fl. c. 770), the Nyāyabinduṭīkā; and the Brahman scholar Durvekamiśra's sub-commentary on Dharmottara.

Translation: There is a dated and eccentric (but nonetheless useful) translation by Th. Stcherbatsky, in volume two of his Buddhist Logic (1932; reprinted by Mouton & Co., 1958; and subsequent reprints as well).

Background and reference works: Hattori Masaaki, Dignāga, On Perception, being the Pratyakṣapariccheda of Dignāga's Pramāṇasamuccaya from the Sanskrit fragments and the Tibetan versions (Harvard University Press, 1968); Richard P. Hayes, Dignāga on the Interpretation of Signs (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1988); John Dunne, Foundations of Dharmakīrti's Philosophy (Boston: Wisdom, 2004); Georges Dreyfus, Recognizing Reality: Dharmakīrti's Philosophy and its Tibetan Interpreters (Albany: SUNY Press, 1997).

Nāgārjuna (fl. c. 150), **Vigrahavyāvartanī**.

Edition: The Sanskrit of this text was edited by E. H. Johnston and Arnold Kunst, "The Vigrahavyāvartanī of Nāgārjuna," Mélanges chinois et bouddhiques IX (1951): 108-151.

Translation: That edition, along with a reliable translation by Bhattacharya, are available in Kamaleswar Bhattacharya, The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna: Vigrahavyāvartanī (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1990).

Nāgārjuna, **Mūlamadhyamakakārikā**.

Edition: The Sanskrit of Nāgārjuna's text is available only as embedded in the commentary of Candrakīrti (fl. c. 600), the Prasannapadā. The standard edition of the Sanskrit of this text is Louis de La Vallée Poussin, ed., Mūlamadhyamakakārikās (Mādhyamikasūtras) de Nāgārjuna, avec la Prasannapadā Commentaire de Candrakīrti (Bibliotheca Buddhica, Vol. IV; reprinted Osnabrück: Biblio Verlag, 1970). This should be used along with J. W. de Jong, "Text-critical Notes on the Prasannapadā," Indo-Iranian Journal 20 (1978), nos.1/2: 25-59; nos.3/4: 217-252. Based on the additional manuscripts available to him, de Jong also prepared a new edition of Nāgārjuna's kārikās alone: J. W. de Jong, ed., Mūlamadhyamakakārikāḥ (Adyar, Madras: Adyar Library and Research Center, 1977).

Translations: There is no complete western-language translation of Candrakīrti's commentary. The partial translation of Mervyn Sprung – Lucid Exposition of the Middle Way: The Essential Chapters from the Prasannapadā of Candrakīrti (London: Routledge, 1979) – is problematic, and should be used with caution. There are numerous translations of Nāgārjuna's root text, all of which should be used with care. While not without its problems as a translation, the most accessible and illuminating study / translation is Jay Garfield, The Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way: Nāgārjuna's Mūlamadhyamakakārikā (Oxford University Press, 1995).

Studies and reference works: David Seyfort Ruegg, The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India (vol. VII, Fasc. 1 of Jan Gonda, ed., A History of Indian Literature; Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1981); Chr. Lindtner,

Nagarjuniana: Studies in the Writings and Philosophy of Nāgārjuna (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1987); Georges Dreyfus and Sara McClintock, eds., The Svātantrika-Prāsaṅgika Distinction: What Difference Does a Difference Make? (Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2003); Susumu Yamaguchi, Index to the Prasannapadā Madhyamakāvṛtti (Kyoto: Heirakuji-shoten, 1974); Andrew Tuck, Comparative Philosophy and the Philosophy of Scholarship: On the Western Interpretation of Nāgārjuna (Oxford University Press, 1990).

Candrakīrti (fl. c. 600), **Madhyamakāvatāra(bhāṣya)**.

Edition: The original Sanskrit text is not available (though it is rumored to be among a group of Sanskrit Buddhist texts that has recently surfaced in China); the Tibetan translation (Toh. 3861) was edited by Louis de La Vallée Poussin: Madhyamakāvatāra par Candrakīrti: Traduction tibétaine (Bibliotheca Buddhica, Vol. IX; reprinted Osnabrück: Biblio Verlag, 1970).

Translations: La Vallée Poussin translated about two thirds of Candrakīrti's root text (along with Candrakīrti's commentary) into French: "Madhyamakāvatāra. Introduction au Traité du milieu de l'Ācārya Candrakīrti, avec le commentaire de l'auteur, traduit d'après la version tibétaine," Le Muséon, n.s., vol. 8 (1907): 249-317 [Madhyamakāvatāra 1.1-5.1]; ns., vol. 11 (1910): 271-358 [Madhyamakāvatāra 6.1-6.80]; n.s., vol. 12 (1911): 235-328 [Madhyamakāvatāra 6.81-6.165]. The complete text of Candrakīrti's kārikās was translated (with significant extracts from the bhāṣya included in the endnotes) by C. W. Huntington (with Geshe Namgyal Wangchen), The Emptiness of Emptiness: An Introduction to Early Indian Mādhyamika (University of Hawaii Press, 1989).

Śāntarakṣita (c.725-788), **Madhyamakālamkāra**.

Edition / translation: The original Sanskrit text is lost; the Tibetan translation (Toh. 3884) was edited and translated by Ichigō Masamichi, "Śāntarakṣita's Madhyamakālamkāra," in Luis Gómez and Jonathan Silk, eds., Studies in the Literature of the Great Vehicle: Three Mahāyāna Buddhist Texts, pp.141-240 (Ann Arbor: Center for South and Southeast Asian Studies, The University of Michigan, 1989). This work is best read together with Kamalaśīla's commentary, the Madhyamakālamkārapañjikā, which is extant only in Tibetan translation (Toh. 3886). This commentary has been edited, along with Śāntarakṣita's kārikās, by Ichigō: Chūgan Shōgonron no Kenkyū (Kyoto: Buneidō, 1985).

Study: James Blumenthal, The Ornament of the Middle Way: A Study of the Madhyamaka Thought of Śāntarakṣita (Ithaca: Snow Lion, 2004).

Mokṣākaragupta (fl. twelfth century), **Tarkabhāṣā**.

Edition: B. N. Singh, ed., Bauddha-Tarkabhāṣā of Mokṣākaragupta (Varanasi: Asha Prakashan, 1985).

Translation: Kajiyama Yuichi, An Introduction to Buddhist Philosophy: An Annotated Translation of the Tarkabhāṣā of Mokṣākaragupta (Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien Universität Wien, 1998).